

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

EGYPT
COUNTRY REPORT

2024



Executive Summary

This report is an evaluation of the state of digital rights in Egypt in 2024 and serves as complementary to the Londa Egypt report published in 2023.843 Although, there is no significant change or progress in the state of digital rights in Egypt during the covered period, this report reflects the continuous practices that present the closing of digital civic space in Egypt. The Londa report 2024 highlights the use of different legal tools as justification to abuse the digital rights and affirms the inefficiency of adopted safeguards. The focal points of this assessment encompass themes such as internet accessibility and interruptions, freedom of expression in online spaces, privacy and surveillance issues, data protection, cybersecurity, the Universal Service Fund, and advancements in Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs), along with emerging technologies. The findings of this report highlight that while some of the current legal frameworks safeguard the digital rights of internet users, paradoxically, some provisions enable digital rights abuses and are a means to restrict the digital civic space.

The report employed both analytical and qualitative research methodologies. Secondary data was gathered through an extensive literature review, delving into the primary themes discussed within. The proposed recommendations advocate for the implementation of dedicated legislation governing the creation and utilisation of artificial intelligence (AI) systems, focusing on adopting approaches that prioritise human rights in the digital age. It is also imperative to formulate executive regulations (bylaws) to streamline the enforcement of data protection laws. Additionally, introducing access to information law is essential to foster governance that is both transparent and accountable. The report uses a digital rights index to evaluate compliance of Egypt with regard to key human rights elements and is inspired by the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights' Declaration of Principles on Freedom of Expression and Access to Information.844

RIGHTS AND **INCLUSION** IN AFRICA **REPORT**

> **LONDA** 2024

843

Mohamed Farahat, Egypt Digital Rights And Inclusion 2023 Report, Londa,

Paradigm Initiative

https://paradigmhq.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/06/Egypt-Londa-Report.pdf

844

https://achpr.au.int/en/node/902



DIGITAL

Introduction

3

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

LONDA 2024 Egypt is a North African country with an estimated population of 117,406,765 by December 2024⁸⁴⁵. In 2024, 41% of the total population lived in urban areas and 59% of the total population reside in rural areas⁸⁴⁶. The country is party to several international human rights binding treaties that emphasise and guarantee internet freedoms and digital rights, such as the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, and the Arab Convention of Anti-Information Technology Crimes (Cybercrimes). Egypt is yet to ratify the 2014 African Union Convention on Cyber Security and Personal Data Protection (the Malabo Convention). It is therefore envisaged that Egyptian domestic laws need to be aligned with existing international human rights laws and standards.

Since 2018, Egypt has been enacting legislation that significantly shapes the landscape of digital rights. Laws that govern internet freedoms include the Personal Data Protection Law No. 151 of 2020 and the Law no. 175 of 2018 combating information technology crimes. Egypt also enacted national security and anti-terrorism laws. However, rather than primarily safeguarding digital rights, these legislative frameworks have often been utilised to restrict the civic space. Regrettably, the implementation of these measures has also had adverse consequences on media freedoms. 488

Moreover, in the aftermath of the COVID-19 pandemic, Egypt continues to grapple with the dissemination of false information in its various manifestations, such as misinformation and disinformation. It is, therefore, evidently imperative to adopt access to information legislation to guarantee the proactive dissemination of credible information to the public by relevant stakeholders and to prevent spreading false information. Generally, there was no significant improvement in the digital rights situation in Egypt in 2024, juxtaposed with the developments observed over the preceding five years. According to Freedom House, Egypt's score for internet freedom was 26 out of 100 in 2019, 27 out of 100 in 2020, and 28 out of 100 in 2023 and 2024. Throughout the five-year period, Egypt was classified as "not free" in the category of internet freedom. The subsequent sections of this report explore the reasons behind the low rate of internet freedoms, examining whether the root cause lies in legislation or its execution.

This report examines the state of digital rights and digital inclusion in Egypt in 2024. It covers the dynamics of internet freedom, the right to privacy, surveillance, online expression, data protection, the universal service fund and AI regulation.

.

Worldometers, Egypt, https://www.worldometers.info/world-population/egypt-population/

^{846 .} Worldometers, Egypt, https://www.worldometers.info/demographics/egypt-demographics/#urb

Mohamed Farahat, (2021). Egypt Digital Rights And Inclusion, LONDA, Paradigm Initiative,. https://paradigmhq.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/lr-Egypt-Digital-Rights-Inclusion-2020-Report.pdf, Mohamed Farahat (2021), Egypt Digital Rights Landscape Report, in T. Roberts (ed.), Digital Rights in Closing Civic Space: Lessons from Ten African Countries, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, DOI: 10.19088/IDS.2021.014. AND, Miral Sabry AlAshry, op.cit.,

Miral Sabry AlAshry (2022) A critical assessment of the impact of Egyptian laws on information access and dissemination by journalists, Cogent Arts & Humanities. P. 1. DOI: 10.1080/23311983.2022.2115

Mohamed Farahat, Coronavirus Trials in Egypt: Blurring the Lines Between Fake News and Freedom of Expression, SMEX.

Freedom House, "Freedom On The Net 2024, Egypt", https://freedomhouse.org/country/egypt/freedom-net/2024#B

Internet Access

As reported by the Egyptian Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (MCIT), in the period from April to June 2024, the mobile subscriptions was 110.41 million⁸⁵¹ which constitutes 94% of the total population. According to the International Telecommunication Union (ITU), in 2022, mobile telephone subscriptions reached 93%.⁸⁵² In November 2023, the percentage soared to 96.73%.⁸⁵³ Subscribers numbered 102.77 million in March 2023⁸⁵⁴, and this figure increased to 103.74 million by November 2024.⁸⁵⁵. From April to June 2024, the fixed line subscriptions stood at 12.84 million, with 10 million in urban areas and 2.84 million in rural areas⁸⁵⁶

At the beginning of 2024, there were 82.01 million internet users in Egypt, when internet penetration was 72.2%857. According to the Speedtest Global Index, the speed of fixed broadband in Egypt in November 2024 was 76.67 Mbps, ranking 81 globally out of 154 country 858, while in October 2023 it was 61.22 Mbps, ranking 83rd globally.859 In terms of mobile speed, it was 24.7 Mbps, ranking 92 globally out of 110 countries 860. Regarding internet connectivity, the year 2024 witnessed an increase in the percentage of internet penetration, as 83.02 % of the population was connected 861., compared to 71.9% in 2022 862. In the start of 2023, only 72.2% of the population was connected⁸⁶³, This percentage was the same by January 2024⁸⁶⁴. It is worth mentioning that there is some analysis indicating an increase in the number of internet users in Egypt. According to "Kepios analysis indicates that internet users in Egypt increased by 1.3 million (+1.6 percent) between January 2023 and January 2024."865 in terms of mobile network coverage, in 2024,866 99.89 % of the population was covered by 3G mobile network, while 99.62% was covered by 4G mobile network.867 Egypt is one of 14 countries in Africa where 5G networks are being tested or widely deployed. 868 Other African countries, including North African countries, still invest in 4G networks.869 Egypt has achieved remarkable strides in connectivity and is among the leading countries on the continent in this regard.

In the context of social media users, there were 45.40 million social media users in Egypt

Ministry of Communications and Information Technology,ICT Indicators in Brief June 2024 | Quarterly Issue. P.2. https://mcit.gov.eg/Upcont/Documents/Publications_992024000_ICT_Indicators_Quarterly_Bulletin_Q2_2024.pdf

852 International Telecommunication Union (ITU), (2022), The Digital Development Dashboard, Egypt. P1. https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-D/Statistics/Documents/DDD/ddd_EGY.pdf

Ministry of Communications and Information Technology,ICT Indicators in Brief December 2023 | Monthly Issue. P.2. https://mcit.gov.eg/Upcont/Documents/Publications_1512024000_ICT_Indicators_in_Brief_December_2023_15012024.pdf

Ministry of Communications and Information Technology. (2021-2022). Survey of ICT usage in household and individuals. Retrieved from https://mcit.gov.eg/Upcont/Documents/Publications_1272023000_ICT_Indicators_Quarterly_Bulletin_Q1_2023.pdf

Ministry of Communications and Information Technology,ICT Indicators in Brief December 2023 | Monthly Issue.P.2 https://mcit.gov.eg/Upcont/Documents/Publications_1512024000_ICT_Indicators_in_Brief_December_2023_15012024.pdf

Ministry of Communications and Information Technology,ICT Indicators in Brief June 2024 | Quarterly Issue. P.2. https://mcit.gov.eg/Upcont/Documents/Publications_992024000_ICT_Indicators_Quarterly_Bulletin_Q2_2024.pdf

Data Reportal , Egypt 2024, https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2024-egypt?rq=egypt

858 . Speedtest Global Index. Egypt's Mobile and Broadband Internet Speeds - Speedtest Global Index

859 Speedtest Global Index. https://www.speedtest.net/global-index/egypt#mobile

860 Speedtest Global Index. Egypt's Mobile and Broadband Internet Speeds - Speedtest Global Index

Stasista, Digital & Connectivity Indicators – Egypt. https://www.statista.com/outlook/co/digital-connectivity-indicators/egypt#:~:text=The%204G%20network%20coverage%20in,to%20amount%2099.89%25%20in%202024

Data Reportal , Egypt 2022, https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2022-egypt

Data Reportal , Egypt 2023,https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2023-egypt

864 . Data Reportal , Egypt 2024, https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2024-egypt

Data Reportal , Egypt 2024, https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2024-egyp

Figures of 2023 were not available during the time of writing this report.

Stasista, Digital & Connectivity Indicators – Egypt. https://www.statista.com/outlook/co/digital-connectivity-indicators/egypt#:~:text=The%204G%20network%20coverage%20in.to%20amount%2099.89%25%20in%202024.

Diplo Foundation, Status of internet access and connectivity in Africa, https://www.diplomacy.edu/resource/report-stronger-digi-tal-voices-from-africa/internet-access-connectivity-africa/

Diplo Foundation, Status of internet access and connectivity in Africa, https://www.diplomacy.edu/resource/report-stronger-digi-tal-voices-from-africa/internet-access-connectivity-africa/

4

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

in January 2024, equating to 40% of the total population⁸⁷⁰. According to statcounter, in the period from November 2023 through November 2024, 63.96% of the population was using Facebook, 18.57% using Instagram, 9.7% using YouTube, 4.17% using Twitter, and 0.68% using LinkedIn.⁸⁷¹

Privacy and Surveillance

As mentioned earlier, Egypt is a party to most of the international human rights binding treaties which emphasise and guarantee the rights to privacy and prohibit unlawful surveillance practices. Principle 40 of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights' (ACHPR) 2019 Declaration of Principles on Freedom of Expression and Access to Information in Africa (the Declaration) states that "everyone has the right to privacy, including the confidentiality of their communications and the protection of their personal information and everyone has the right to communicate anonymously or use pseudonyms on the internet and to secure the confidentiality of their communications and personal information from access by third parties through the aid of digital technologies". 872

Article 57 of the Constitution provides the protection to the right to privacy and this provision aligns with principle 40 of the ACHPR 2019 Declaration and other international human rights treaties and standards. Article 57 states that "the right to privacy may not be violated, shall be protected and may not be infringed upon. Postal, telegraphic, and electronic correspondence, telephone conversations, and other means of communication are inviolable, their confidentiality is guaranteed, and they may not be confiscated, viewed, or monitored except by a reasoned judicial order for a specific period and in the circumstances specified by law."873 The State is also committed to protecting citizens' right to use public means of communication in all its forms. It is not permissible to disrupt, stop, or deprive citizens of them arbitrarily. While this is regulated by law, other laws have provisions that undermine the right to privacy, as expounded later in this report. In terms of promoting children's digital safety and privacy online, Egypt adopted different laws seeking to protect children in general including in digital sphere such as children law no 12 of year 1996, Penal Code, cybercrimes law, data protection law, and law no 64 of year 2010 in concern of combat trafficking in persons.

In addition, Article 99 of the Constitution establishes the right to remedies and compensation for damage resulting from abuse of privacy. Article 99 stipulates that "any violation of personal freedom, or the sanctity of the private life of citizens, or any other public rights and freedoms which are guaranteed by the Constitution and the Law is a crime. The criminal and civil lawsuit arising from such crime shall not abate by prescription. The affected party shall have the right to bring a direct criminal action." The right to remedy and compensation are guaranteed by the Constitution and also guaranteed under article 163 of civil law; In particular, there are many compensation claims submitted to Egyptian courts for breach of privacy with final judgement in favour of affected persons

Article 25 of Law No. 175 of 2018 on Combating Information Technology Crimes criminalises the breach of the family's principles and values of Egyptian society and the violation of the inviolability of private life. It is punished by imprisonment for a period of not less than six months and a fine of not less than 50,000 Egyptian pounds (USD 1600) and not exceeding 100,000 pounds (USD 3200). The same Article includes some actions that constitute a breach of privacy, such as sending a large number of messages electronically to a specific person without his consent, granting data to a system or website to promote goods or services without their consent, or publishing, via the information network or by any means of information technology, information, news, pictures, and the like, that violate the privacy of any person without his consent, whether the published information is correct or incorrect. Article 26 of the same law added that "anyone who intentionally uses an information program or information technology to process personal data of others in order to link it to content that is contrary to public morals or to display it in a way that would infringe on his character or honour. In the same context, Article 20 of Law No. 180 of 2018 regarding Regulating the Press, Media, and the Supreme Council for Media Regulation stipulated that "It is prohibited in any means of publication or broadcast to breach the private lives of citizens".

Data portal https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2024-egypt?rq=egypt

StateCounter, Global State, Social Media Stats Egypt , Nov 2023 - Nov 2024 https://gs.statcounter.com/social-media-stats/all/

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights ,the Declaration of Principles on Freedom of Expression and Access to Information in Africa, 2019.

873 Egypt , Constitution 2014 article 57.

874 Constitution article 99.

egypt

5

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

In terms of surveillance practices in Egypt ⁸⁷⁵ according to principle 41 of the ACHPR 2019 Declaration, states shall rely on it if it is "authorised by law, that conforms with international human rights law and standards, and that is premised on specific and reasonable suspicion that a serious crime has been or is being carried out or for any other legitimate aim". ⁸⁷⁶ In the Egyptian context, community standards and ensuring national security are always used as justification for undertaking surveillance. ⁸⁷⁷ Under the regime of Hosni Mubarak surveillance practices were primarily focused on monitoring terrorist activities. However, the dynamics have transformed significantly in the aftermath of the 2011 revolution and subsequent political events, emanating from the pivotal role that social media played. Surveillance measures have expanded beyond tracking terrorist activities. Rigorous steps were implemented to regulate internet access and scrutinise online content. Legislation is used to ban websites, obtain personal data, abuse citizens' right to privacy and criminalise the right to freedom of expression through allegations of disseminating false news. ⁸⁷⁸

As already stated, Article 57 of the Constitution prohibits surveillance except when authorised by a judicial order, strictly for a defined duration, and in cases specified by the law. Article 71 of the Constitution stipulates that "it is prohibited to censor, confiscate, suspend or shut down Egyptian newspapers and media in any way. In exceptional circumstances, they may be subject to limited censorship in times of war or general mobilisation". 879 However, the same laws contain specific provisions that grant powers to the authorities to block websites that are deemed a threat to national security. Article 1 of the Cybercrimes Law No. 175 of 2018 defines national security as everything related to the independence, stability, and security of the homeland and anything linked to affairs of the Presidency, the Ministry of Defense and General Intelligence. The term 'national security' is vague and shrouded in ambiguity. The lack of clarity in defining national security bestows unfettered discretionary powers upon the authorities, allowing them to decide which actions may pose a threat to national security. Although the Constitution prohibits surveillance practices without a judicial order, the different laws provide the legal basis for surveillance, such as Telecommunications Regulation Law No. 10 of 2003, Personal Data Protection Law No. 151 of 2020, Anti-Terrorism Law No. 94 of 2015, Anti-Cyber and Information Technology Crimes no. 175 of 2018, and Emergency Law no. 162 of 1958.880 On the basis of the information already provided, it can be asserted that the existing laws exhibit a partial alignment with international human rights standards at a superficial level. However, the same laws contain provisions that undermine digital rights.

Irrespective of the Egyptian legal framework which to some extent protects the right to privacy, the actual practice witnessed served as abuse to this fundamental right, and demonstrates that the existing legal framework was used to justify the digital surveillance. For instance, according to Thomson Reuters Foundation, the new administrative capital was deployed by 6000 surveillance camera⁸⁸¹. According to People in Need, "Digital censorship was evident, in the period between May 2023 and 1 May 2024, there were five instances where digital platforms were blocked, further restricting access to information and limiting journalistic freedom⁸⁸²" In the same context and according to Freedom House, "Egyptian governments use Sandvine devices to block websites and monitor, prevent, or tamper with connections" ⁸⁸³. The flagship product of Sandvine "is deep

For detailed information about surveillance practices and related framework refer to Mohamed Farahat (2021), Egypt country report, in Surveillance Law in Africa: a Review of Six Countries, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, pp.48-70. DOI: 10.19088/IDS.2021.059

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, The Declaration of Principles of Freedom of Expression and Access to Information in Africa 2019.

877 OpenNet Initiative (September 2004). A Starting Point: Legal Implications Of Internet Filtering.

Mohamed Farahat (2021), Egypt country report, in Surveillance Law in Africa: a Review of Six Countries, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, p.48. DOI: 10.19088/IDS.2021.059 p.48.

879 Constitution article 71

Mohamed Farahat (2021), Egypt country report, in Surveillance Law in Africa: a Review of Six Countries, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies. pp.53-56. DOI: 10.19088/IDS.2021.059

And , Mohamed Farahat ,Mohamed Farahat, Egypt Digital Rights and Inclusion 2020 report, LONDA, Paradigm Initiative https://paradigmhq.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/lr-Egypt-Digital-Rights-Inclusion-2020-Report.pdf

881 . Thomson Reuters Foundation, CCTV cameras will watch over Egyptians in new high-tech capital,4 January 2023

People in Need, Report: Violations of journalist and media rights in Egypt (May 2023 - May 2024), Published: Sep 20, 2024. https://www.peopleinneed.net/report-violations-of-journalist-and-media-rights-in-egypt-may-2023-may-2024-11862gp

Freedom House, Key Developments, June 1, 2023 - May 31, 2024. https://freedomhouse.org/country/egypt/freedomnet/2024#footnoteref15_ SkY8W4xsgQfWO6slCXHW5-YXwAktvCYGYMgBYfXwANI_nhebWdJe4puP 6

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

packet inspection (DPI) which is a common tool used by ISPs and telecom companies to monitor traffic and prioritize certain types of content, however it is also used to divert traffic away from sites or social media platforms and into dead ends, effectively censoring them.⁸⁸⁴" According to WIRED website, "In February 2024,the US Department of Commerce added Sandvine to its Entity List, effectively blacklisting it from doing business with American partners due to the fact that the company's technology was used in mass-web monitoring and censorship in Egypt contrary to the national security and foreign policy interests of the United States.⁸⁸⁵"

Online Freedom of Expression

The ACHPR 2019 Declaration stresses the importance of both rights and states that "[t]he respect, protection and fulfilment of these rights is crucial and indispensable for the free development of the human person, the creation and nurturing of democratic societies and for enabling the exercise of other rights". This segment of the report underscores the correlation between freedom of expression and the right to access information. When both rights are guaranteed without undue restrictions, it contributes to combating the spreading of false news while promoting freedom of expression, including the right to engage in constructive criticism of government policies.

Despite the surveillance practices outlined earlier, it is essential to underscore the constitutional assurance of freedom of expression. Article 65 guarantees freedom of thought and opinion and all individuals have the right to express their opinions through various means of expression and publication, including digital platforms. However, Article 102 (Bis) of the Penal Code criminalises broadcasting false news, statements, or rumours, particularly if such actions are considered to potentially disturb public security, spread terror among people, or jeopardise public interest. While the legitimacy of criminalising the publication of false news is acknowledged, the existing legal framework does not define the parameters of what constitutes harm to public security and interest. Moreover, article 19 of Law No. 180 of 2018, Regulating the Press, Media, and the Supreme Council for Media Regulation, prohibits the publication of false news, incitements of violations of the law, promotion of violence or hatred, and discrimination between citizens. It also forbids publication of content that endorses racism or includes an abuse of the honour of individuals, cursing or slandering them, or insulting religions. Article 4 of this law also restricts the publication of content that contradicts the Constitution. In this regard, it explicitly prohibits the promotion of activities that encourage legal violations, contravene the professional code of honour, disrupt public order, or undermine public morals. The Article also prohibits the propagation of content that fosters discrimination, violence, racism, or hatred.

Evidently, the aforementioned provision exhibits legal deficiencies characterised by the utilisation of ambiguous terms like "public order" and "public morality." It also fails to specify actions deemed as detrimental to the honour of individuals. The lack of precision raises concerns regarding the clarity and enforceability of the provision, warranting a careful reassessment to enhance its legal robustness and effectiveness. Also, the absence of a well-defined legal framework that distinguishes between misinformation and the lawful dissemination and unrestricted flow of information poses a significant challenge to the preservation of freedom of expression that is constitutionally guaranteed. The country's 2021 National Human Rights strategy that was developed by the government acknowledges "the lack of a legal framework regulating access to and circulation of official information, data, and statistics, albeit being a constitutional right".887

Egypt is yet to enact an access to information law, a situation which is contrary to the aspiration enshrined under principle 26 of the ACHPR 2019 Declaration which stipulates that the law shall guarantee the right of access to information. Therefore, dissemination of information that deviates from official government publications is consistently deemed a violation, constituting the offence of disseminating false information.

The laws above serve as mechanisms to restrict freedom of expression. According to Association for Freedom of Thoughts and Expression (AFTE) "Egyptian authorities is continuing within the

WIRED, Dictators Used Sandvine Tech to Censor the Internet. The US Finally Did Something About It, Feb,2024. https://www.wired.com/story/sandvine-us-sanctions-egypt-internet-censorship/

885 WIRED, Dictators Used Sandvine Tech to Censor the Internet. The US Finally Did Something About It, Feb,2024. https://www.wired.com/story/sandvine-us-sanctions-egypt-internet-censorship/

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, The Declaration of Principles of Freedom of Expression and Access to Information in Africa 2019 Principle 1

Egypt, SupremeStanding Committee for Human Rights, National Human Rights Strategy (2021) p31 https://sschr.gov.eg/media/gapb5bq4/national-human-rights-strategy.pdf

7

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

first quarter of 2024 by targeting content creators and publishers on various digital platforms, especially Facebook and TikTok"888. During the covered period first quarter of 2024, "AFTE recorded six cases, including the arrest of citizens for posting content on Facebook that criticized the political authorities, expressed solidarity with the Palestinian cause, or criticized religious institutions. Additionally, TikTok content creators were arrested for allegedly threatening Egyptian family values".⁸⁸⁹

The first quarter of 2024 witnessed several arrest and court trial cases based on the above-mentioned laws which target content creators and 'Online Opinion Expressers- OOE'. For instance, "on January 18th, 2024, the Nasr City Second Misdemeanors Court sentenced engineer Yahya Hussein Abdel Hadi, a former spokesperson and co-founder of the Civil Democratic Movement, to one year in prison with a suspended sentence for "spreading false news due to his several opinion articles published on his Facebook account". ⁸⁹⁰ Furthermore, "On February 13th, 2024, Mohamed Ali Ahmed was arrested from his home in Kafr Saqr, Sharqia Governorate, due to Facebook posts mocking President El-Sisi and on February 16th, 2024, Mohamed Atef Eid Farhat was arrested due to social media posts supporting Palestine and calling for the regime's departure; In both cases, the prosecution brought charges that included joining a terrorist group, spreading false news and misusing social media. ⁸⁹¹"

These practices have continued during the second quarter of 2024, as "on 26 May 2024, the Ismailia Misdemeanor Court sentenced Sherif Gaber Abdel-Azim in absentia to five years in prison in Case No. 3391 of 2024 (Ismailia Misdemeanors), over online videos and posts that incited atheism and disdained Islam"⁸⁹². TikTok cases which are known in the media as TikTok' girls cases appeared again during the second quarter of 2024. These trials and prosecution are based mainly on Article 25 of the Cybercrimes law.

On 26 May 2024, "blogger Hadeer Abdel-Razek was arrested on charges of publishing indecent videos that incite debauchery and immorality. On 1 June 2024, blogger Somaya Neston was arrested for sharing indecent videos on social media, and on charges of publishing indecent videos and inciting debauchery and immorality, and on 23 April 2024, blogger Nadine Tarek was arrested for sharing a video of herself which the security services said was suggestive and incited debauchery and immorality. The prosecution charged her with violating the family values of Egyptian society, publishing indecent videos, promoting prostitution and misusing social media" B93. The cases shown above illustrate how the existing legal framework is used to close the digital civic space.

Data Protection

The Data Protection Law (DPL) No 151 of 2020 was enacted in 2020. Despite its enactment, the executive regulation of the data protection law is yet to be adopted. The undue delay in promulgating the regulation poses a significant obstacle to law enforcement, notably impeding the establishment of essential guidelines necessary for the proper execution and compliance with the provisions outlined in the legislation. According to Articles 2 and 6(1) of the DPL, consent from the data subject for processing and gathering personal data is required in processing data. In addition, Article 2 gives the data subjects control over their data and allows them to delete it. The data subject has the following rights:

- 1. Knowing, accessing, or obtaining personal data held by any holder, controller, or processor.
- 2. Changing the prior consent to retain or process his personal data.
- 3. Correction, modification, erasure, addition or updating of personal data.

AFTE, The First Quarterly Report on the State of Freedom of Expression in Egypt (From January 1 to March 30, 2024). https://afteegypt.org/en/research-en/2024/06/04/37481-afteegypt.html#_heading=h.35nkun2

AFTE, The First Quarterly Report on the State of Freedom of Expression in Egypt (From January 1 to March 30, 2024). https://afteegypt.org/en/research-en/2024/06/04/37481-afteegypt.html#_heading=h.35nkun2

AFTE, The First Quarterly Report on the State of Freedom of Expression in Egypt (From January 1 to March 30, 2024). https://afteegypt.org/en/research-en/2024/06/04/37481-afteegypt.html# heading=h.35nkun2

891 . AFTE, The First Quarterly Report on the State of Freedom of Expression in Egypt (From January 1 to March 30, 2024). https://afteegypt.org/en/research-en/2024/06/04/37481-afteegypt.html#_heading=h.35nkun2

892 . AFTE, The second quarterly report on the state of freedom of expression in Egypt (1 April – 30 June 2024) https://afteegypt.org/en/research-en/monitoring-reports-en/2024/07/24/37845-afteegypt.html

893 AFTE, The second quarterly report on the state of freedom of expression in Egypt (1 April – 30 June 2024) https://afteegypt.org/en/research-en/monitoring-reports-en/2024/07/24/37845-afteegypt.html

8

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

- 4. Allocate treatment within a specific scope.
- 5. Knowing of any breach or violation of his personal data.
- 6. Objecting to the processing of personal data or its results if they conflict with the basic rights and freedoms of the person concerned with the data.

In terms of transparency, the DPL is aligned with international standards in this regard, particularly Article 13 of the Malabo Convention includes provisions regarding transparency requirements on data usage. ⁸⁹⁴ According to Article 2 of the law, a person has a right to know, access, or obtain their personal data. In addition, the data subject has a right to be informed of any breach or violation of their personal data. According to Article 7 of personal data protection law, the data breach incident shall be reported to the data protection centre within 72 hours and in case that data is related to national security should be reported immediately. The data subject should be notified of the data breach within the next three days after reporting the breach to the centre. Furthermore, Article 3 emphasises the principle of legitimacy in collecting and processing personal data. Article 3 stipulates conditions that should be met in the collection, processing and retention of personal data. These are:

- 1. Personal data is collected for legitimate, specific and declared purposes for the person concerned.
- 2. It must be correct, sound and secure.
- 3. To be processed in a lawful and appropriate manner for the purposes for which it was collected.

Data minimisation is one of the data protection principles guaranteed by Article 3 of the data protection law. Article 3 emphasises that the collected data should not be kept longer than necessary to fulfil its specified purpose. The executive regulations of this law specify the policies, procedures, controls and standards for collecting, processing, preserving and securing this data. Data minimisation regulation in the law ensures that organisations collect, process, and retain only the personal data that is strictly necessary for the purpose for which it was collected. This provision is aligned with Article 22 of the African Union, African Convention on Cybersecurity and Personal Data Protection 2014 (Malabo Convention), which permits the retention of personal data until the fulfilment of the intended purpose for which the data were originally collected and processed. However, Article 2 of the Cybercrimes Law No 175 of 2018 grants permission to service providers to retain and store user data for 180 days. This provision for data retention contradicts the Data Protection Law. The Cybercrime Law does not include a provision that justifies personal data retention for that timeframe. The law should be amended to enhance transparency and incorporate a clear justification for data retention.

The Data Protection Law has provisions that regulate the processing of sensitive personal data. Article 12 prohibits the collection, transfer, storage, retention, processing, or disclosure of sensitive personal data except with authorisation from the "personal data protection centre".896 Except in cases authorised by law, written and explicit consent is required from the person concerned. Additionally, when processing children's personal data, the consent of the guardian must be secured for the aforementioned operations. Participation of a child in activities such as games, competitions, or any other engagements should not be contingent upon the provision of personal data beyond what is strictly essential for their involvement in the said activity. Article 1 of the law defines sensitive data as data that discloses psychological, mental, physical or genetic health, biometric data, financial data, religious beliefs, political opinions, or security status. In all cases, children's data is considered sensitive personal data. Article 41 of the law states that "Any holder, controller, or processor who collects, makes available, circulates, processes, discloses, stores, transmits or saves sensitive personal data shall be punished by imprisonment for a period of not less than three months and a fine of not less than 500,000 pounds and not exceeding five million pounds, or by one of these two penalties, Without the consent of the data subject or in cases other than those legally authorized".

Q

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

LONDA 2024

896

⁸⁹⁴ African Union, African convention on Cybersecurity and personal data protection 2104.

African Union, African convention on Cybersecurity and personal data protection 2014.

According to article 1 of personal data protection law No 151 of 2020, centre refers to the personal data protection centre.

Universal Service Fund (USF)

According to GSMA Intelligence, 897 Universal Service Fund (USF) is based on three principles: availability, affordability, and accessibility. 898 Egypt allocated a specific fund for accessing universal services, regulated by the Telecom Regulation Law no. 10 of 200. Article 2 of that law stipulates that Telecommunication Services shall comply with the following rules:

- 1. Publicity of information;
- 2. Protection of free competition;
- 3. Provision of Universal Service; and
- 4. Protection of Users' rights".

Article 9 stipulates that the National Telecommunications Regulatory Authority (NTRA) is entitled to maintain an autonomous budget, adhering to the guidelines outlined in its internal regulations and in conformity with the Unified Accounting System. This autonomy extends without any restrictions imposed by governmental rules or regulations. In 2005, the National Telecom Regulatory Authority (NTRA) established the USF.899 The USF strives for the provision of essential telecommunication services to every citizen at reasonable rates. 900 There is no publicly available official record about the value of the USF According to some media reports, the USF started with an initial budget of 50 million Egyptian Pounds. 901 Moreover, the National Telecommunications Regulatory Authority (NTRA) has proposed and financed projects to establish, operate, and provide mobile phone services to 54 urban areas and 22 strategic roads throughout the Republic, with a total length of 3,100 km, and a total cost of one billion and 668 million Egyptian pounds (USD 54 million). 902 Furthermore, the National Telecommunications Regulatory Authority (NTRA) has initiated measures to enhance the efficacy of fundamental communication services within the Sinai Peninsula. The initiative involves the funding, construction, and operation of mobile phone stations across 30 urban areas and along four critical roads of a total distance of 112 kilometres. The investment in this initiative amounts to 513 million Egyptian Pounds (USD 16,000,000), reflecting NTRA's commitment to advancing connectivity and infrastructure. 903

Available media reports indicate that in a meeting held in January 2023, with the Parliamentary committeeresponsiblefortelecommunication and information technology, the Chairperson of NTRA said that "[t]he Universal Service Fund bears three billion pounds to provide telecommunications services in deprived areas and new roads at a cost of 1.8 billion pounds, in addition to 1.2 billion to establish 592 stations in the first phase for a decent life Project (272727) 27272 272727/ Decent life).904 The aforementioned initiatives and allocated funds, aimed at addressing telecommunication and connectivity challenges illustrate that the USF in Egypt is used to narrow the digital divide between urban and rural areas. Concurrently, these initiatives are focused on enhancing the affordability, accessibility, universality and availability of internet and telecommunication services. This is what is envisaged under principle 41 of the ACHPR 2019 Declaration which requires States, in collaboration with other stakeholders, to adopt measures to ensure universal, equitable, affordable, and meaningful access to the internet without discrimination.905

GSMA Intelligence is the global home of mobile market information, driven by our team of expert analysts and is the definitive source of mobile industry insights, forecasts, and research, used around the world https://www.gsmaintelligence.com.

898 GSMA, (2023). Universal service funds in Africa Policy reforms to enhance effectiveness, p.14. https://www.gsma.com/subsaha-ranafrica/wp-content/uploads/2023/10/USF-Africa.pdf.

899 National Telecom Regulatory Authority (NTRA), Universal Service Policy, P.3. https://www.tra.gov.eg/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/Universal-Service-Policy.pdf

900 National Telecom Regulatory Authority (NTRA), Universal Service Policy, P.8. https://www.tra.gov.eg/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/ Universal-Service-Policy.pdf

/ا-قەدخلامدىقىي-ئالناصتالىل-يىموقىلامزاەجىلا/https://muhtwaplus.com/49705/2020/07/25

902 El Youm El Sabaa, accessed 13 /2/2024. https://www.youm7.com/story/2021/12/8- الما المالك 815571579 المالك 85571579

903 EI Youm El Sabaa, accessed 13 /2/2024. https://www.youm7.com/story/2021/12/8/خىرك-متفرعهديرت-ام-ك-5571579/ عفرل-رپوطتال

904 Sada El-Balad news , https://www.elbalad.news/5594448

905 ACHPR 2019 Declaration principle 41

10

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

USF Initiatives

Roads Infrastructure National Project: It is linked to providing telecommunication services. This project aims to enhance the existing road networks. Additionally, under this project, the basic telecommunications services must be available on these roads, and the Universal Service Fund shall be responsible for the financing of this project for the benefit of the national economy and the Egyptian citizen.⁹⁰⁶

El Million Fadan Project: This project aims to expand the agricultural sector. According to the Egyptian universal service policy, "the availability of telecommunication services in these areas is one of the attractive factors for the success of this project and the universal service is responsible for funding the mobile coverage for these areas". ⁹⁰⁷

National Telecom and Information Plan Projects: These projects include:

- a) **Public educational institutions and libraries** with an annual budget of 50 million Egyptian pounds to fund universal service for the eligible educational institutions and libraries;
- b) **Funding Health Care Centers** accredited by ministry of health and located in rural areas;
- c) **Services Provided to the Disabled**, according to USF's policy Universal service department targets the persons with disabilities (in Egypt and all citizens are entitled to access basic telecommunications services regardless of any type of disability);
- d) Infrastructure of Digital Society and Digital Architecture, to construct a robust telecom infrastructure of Digital Society and Digital Architecture with high speeds and capabilities similar to those of the developed countries;
- e) **Broadband Project**: this project aims to increase the deployment of highspeed internet in Egypt and support the development of the digital community for the purpose of creating jobs, encouraging the utilisation of information and communication technologies in various governmental sectors, thus improving the quality of life for citizens and reducing the digital divide between urban and rural communities".⁹⁰⁸

While acknowledging that the USF regulations focus on digital transformation to a considerable extent, it is imperative to propose recommendations to amend the existing framework so that it explicitly provides for regulating funds for digital literacy and awareness. The abovementioned initiatives contribute to filling the digital gap in Egypt, promoting economic development, and ensuring connectivity in urban and rural areas. As ICT is one of the core services of the government, it is always keen to allocate financial sources to improve.

Developments in ICT and Emerging Technologies

In November 2019, the Egyptian Cabinet approved the establishment of the National Council for Artificial Intelligence (NCAI). 909 At its inception, the primary task of the NCAI was the adoption of a national AI strategy. Subsequently, in July 2021, the NCAI adopted the Egypt AI strategy. 910 At the point of adoption, it was envisaged that the strategy would be implemented in a phased approach until the end of 2022. In 2024, the strategy's execution remained in its initial stage, primarily attributable to the postponed launch. The goal of the initial phase is "to prove the value of

- 906 National Telecom Regulatory Authority (NTRA), Universal Service Policy, P.17. https://www.tra.gov.eg/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/Universal-Service-Policy.pdf
- 907 National Telecom Regulatory Authority (NTRA), Universal Service Policy, P.17. https://www.tra.gov.eg/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/Universal-Service-Policy.pdf.
- 908 National Telecom Regulatory Authority (NTRA), Universal Service Policy, pp.17-19.. https://www.tra.gov.eg/wp-content/up-loads/2020/11/Universal-Service-Policy.pdf, pp. 17-19.
- 909 https://ai.gov.eg

910

Egypt , AI strategy, https://ai.gov.eg/Egypt National AI Strategy (6-4-2021)4.pdf

11

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

Al in the different domains and build the foundations upon which to build Al at scale". 911 Although the Egyptian government adopted the national Al strategy 912 and established the NCAI, binding legislation on Al is yet to be enacted.

Regarding the influence of AI on privacy, Egypt enacted the previously stated cybercrimes and data protection laws in 2018 and 2022 respectively, providing a framework that could be utilised, to some degree, for AI regulation, particularly in terms of privacy and combat arbitrary and unlawful surveillance and personal data protection. However, both laws are inadequate to completely regulate AI in Egypt as both laws tackle human acts and do not expose actions committed by AI systems.

In 2023, the NCAI adopted the Egyptian Charter for responsible AI (the Charter). The main aim of the Charter is to ensure the ethical use, deployment and management of AI systems in Egypt. The Charter also incorporates overarching principles such as fairness, transparency, a focus on human-centeredness, accountability, and the assurance of security and safety. In addition, the strategy acknowledges that "the existence of policies, regulations, and legislation to mitigate potential misuse, whether ethical, legal, or socio-economic, can promote and enable the widespread adoption of AI solutions". This is not the case yet. Egypt's ethical use and deployment of AI systems is undermined by the lack of a national legal framework on AI.

One of the recommendations proposed in the strategy is to "communicate and coordinate with appropriate government bodies to issue laws and regulations when and where needed." This recommendation may be considered a call for the adoption of a regulation where the need arises. The question of adopting independent and specific AI laws and regulations may need more time because Egypt has recently commenced regulating AI by adopting a national strategy and Charter for responsible AI. In this stage, AI may be regulated by adding specific provisions to existing laws. In the same vein, as per media reports, the Parliamentary Committee on Communication and Technology has commenced deliberations on the adoption of AI-related regulations. The Committee Chairperson indicated that the proposed regulation will not be a separate law. Instead, the plan is to introduce AI-specific provisions to the Cybercrimes Law No. 175 for 2018. This approach is the first step towards the establishment of precise regulations governing various facets of AI within the Cybercrimes Law. The imperative to regulate the utilisation of AI systems is strongly advocated for, whether achieved through the enactment of an independent law or the incorporation of targeted provisions into existing legal frameworks.

12

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

⁹¹¹ Egypt AI strategy, p. 60.

⁹¹² Egypt , Egypt Artificial Intelligence Strategy. https://ai.gov.eg/Egypt National Al Strategy (6-4-2021)4.pdf

⁹¹³ Egypt ,Egyptian Charter For Responsible AI https://aicm.ai.gov.eg/en/Resources/EgyptianCharterForResponsibleAlEnglish-v1.0.pdf

⁹¹⁴ Egypt ,Egyptian Charter For Responsible Al. p.1. https://aicm.ai.gov.eg/en/Resources/EgyptianCharterForResponsibleAlEn-

glish-v1.0.pdf

⁹¹⁵ Egypt ,Egyptian Charter For Responsible Al. pp..2-3. https://aicm.ai.gov.eg/en/Resources/EgyptianCharterForResponsibleAlEnglish-v1.0.pdf

⁹¹⁶ Egypt , Al strategy, p.47. https://ai.gov.eg/Egypt National Al Strategy (6-4-2021)4.pdf

⁹¹⁷ Egypt , Al strategy, p.47. https://ai.gov.eg/Egypt National Al Strategy (6-4-2021)4.pdf

Conclusion and Recommendations

While Egypt's current legal frameworks contain provisions aimed at safeguarding digital rights, their efficacy in upholding citizens' right to privacy is questionable. The absence of a precise definition outlining legitimate aims and reasonable grounds for surveillance poses a significant threat to digital rights. Moreover, the lack of clear criteria for identifying false news not only undermines freedom of expression but also opens the door to potential abuse. Addressing these gaps is crucial to fortifying the protection of digital rights and privacy for the citizens of Egypt. Therefore, in light of the identified gaps, stakeholders must consider the recommendations proposed in this report.

Recommendations for Parliament:

- Enact an access to information law and adopt human rights-based approaches to combating the publication of false information.
- Amend the Telecommunications Regulation Law and ensure the legitimacy of surveillance practices.
- Amend Article 2 of Cybercrimes Law No. 175 of 2018, requiring service providers to retain and store data for 180 days by including justifications for the six-month data retention period.
- Enact laws regulating the use of AI systems and their deployment in alignment with the AI strategy.
- Introduce explicit regulations through a standalone law or as an integral component within existing legislation to strengthen the legal framework on privacy rights and their protection. A proposed adjustment involves amending the title of the personal data protection law to: "Privacy and personal data protection". Additionally, emphasis should be placed on including a dedicated and comprehensive chapter solely focused on delineating the rights to privacy and the corresponding safeguards within the legal framework. This nuanced approach ensures a more robust and distinct coverage of privacy concerns, enhancing the overall efficacy of the regulatory measures.

Recommendations for the Government:

- Incorporate digital rights explicitly into the national human rights strategy.
- Refrain from infringing on digital rights like privacy and cease engaging in unauthorised surveillance.
- Enact legislation that promotes the ethical utilisation of artificial intelligence.
- Ratify the Malabo Convention.
- Facilitate access to Universal Service Fund information through official government websites.
- Enhance transparency and accountability by annually publishing comprehensive reports on the Universal Fund's activities and funded projects.
- Craft the USF reports to vividly highlight the significant progress achieved by the USF in narrowing the digital gap and addressing the digital divide. Illustrate the impactful strides made in fostering digital inclusion and reducing disparities.

Recommendations for the National Human Rights Council:

- Engage in continuous monitoring of digital rights violations, document and propose policies and practices that uphold human rights.
- Aligning with their mandate, investigate all digital rights violations and, where necessary, refer violations for further investigation and judicial oversight.

13

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

Recommendations for Civil Society Organisations:

- Enhance the skills of various stakeholders through comprehensive training programs.
- Strengthen the capability of legal professionals, with a particular focus on strategic litigation and the utilisation of international human rights standards in national court proceedings.
- Report any privacy breaches to the National Human Rights Council and other relevant judicial entities.

14

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

The Score Index

15

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

Londa 2025 Key Indicators	ACHPR Declaration (P stands for Principle)	Score	Justification
Internet Shutdowns	P38(2)	4	Although Egyptian authorities resort to block some media websites, the Egyptian government did not disrupt access to the internet and other digital technologies for segments of the public or an entire population.
Inexistent laws, policies and other measures to promote universal, equitable, affordable and meaningful access to the internet	P37	4	All laws , measures, and polices did not exclude some groups
False News Criminalisation	P22(2)	1	False news is criminalised by different laws without clear criteria of what to consider as false news
Sedition Legislation	P22(2)	1	Sedition is criminalised by different laws, without criteria of what to consider sedition. N.B. criminalisation of sedition is not a disliked matter in laws as long it is associated by specific criteria and clear definition. Neither declaration or other international instrument including a clear criteria.
Arbitrary Arrests and Harassments of the Media, HRDs and Citizens	P20(1) & (2)	1	The report documented several cases of arbitrary arrests.
Data Protection Legislation.	P42	3	There is data protection law, however the executive regulation of the law is not yet in existence. In addition the data protection authority is not yet established
States interfere and require the removal of online content by internet intermediaries	P38 and P39(4)	2	Different legislation give the rights to government to ask the regulatory authority to remove online content or entirely or block the website
Invasion of Privacy of Communications	P41	1	Although surveillance is prohibited by the Constitution and other laws, there are laws allowing to surveil the communication and in practice there is evidence on using surveillance to close civic space as articulated in the report.

Failure by the government to proactively disclose and disseminate information digital technologies.	P29(3)	3	The Egyptian government established several platforms to disclose information, however these platforms either do not contain all data and should be open and up to date.
Al and Emerging Technologies national strategies	P39(6)	5	Egypt has an AI national strategy since 2021 and issued the Egyptian charter for responsible AI in 2023. Data protection law, cybercrimes law and other laws include some safeguards in case of misuse of AI
Adoption of specific child laws, policies and measures promoting children's digital safety and privacy online	P37(5)	3	Egypt adopted different laws to protect children in general including in digital sphere such as Children Law no 12 of 1996, penal code, cybercrimes law, data protection law, and law no 64 of 2010 in concern of combat trafficking in persons.
Digital Inclusion	P37(3)	4	The Universal Service Funds are addressing the digital divide and there are different government initiatives to address this gap.
TOTAL (up to 60)		32	

16

DIGITAL RIGHTS AND INCLUSION IN AFRICA REPORT

